Alkaline magmas generated by partial melting of garnet pyroxenite

Marc M. Hirschmann Department of Geology and Geophysics, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455, USA, and Division of Geological and Planetary Science, 170-25, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California 91125, USA

Tetsu Kogiso* Department of Geology and Geophysics, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455, USA

Michael B. Baker Division of Geological and Planetary Sciences, 170-25, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California 91125, USA

Edward M. Stolper

ABSTRACT
Many oceanic-island basalts (OIBs) with isotopic signatures of recycled crustal components are silica poor and strongly nepheline (ne) normative and therefore unlike the silicic liquids generated from partial melting of recycled mid-oceanic-ridge basalt (MORB). High-pressure partial-melting experiments on a garnet pyroxenite (MIX1G) at 2.0 and 2.5 GPa produce strongly ne-normative and silica-poor partial melts. The MIX1G solidus is located below 1350 and 1400 °C at 2 and 2.5 GPa, respectively, slightly cooler than the solidus of dry peridotite. Chemographic analysis suggests that natural garnet pyroxenite compositions straddle a thermal divide. Whereas partial melts of compositions on the silica-excess side of the divide (such as recycled MORB) are silica saturated, those from silica-deficient garnet pyroxenites can be alkalic and have similarities to low-silica OIB. Although the experimental partial melts are too rich in Al₂O₃ to be parental to highly undersaturated OIB suites, higher-pressure (4–5 GPa) partial melting of garnet pyroxenite is expected to yield more appropriate parental liquids for OIB lavas. Silica-deficient garnet pyroxenite, which may originate by mixing of MORB with peridotite, or by recycling of other mafic lithologies, represents a plausible source of OIB that may resolve the apparent contradiction of strongly alkalic composition with isotopic ratios characteristic of a recycled component.

Keywords: pyroxenite, alkali basalt, basanite, partial melting, recycled crust.

INTRODUCTION
There is considerable evidence that the source regions of some oceanic-island basalts (OIBs) contain a component derived from recycled oceanic crust (e.g., Hofmann, 1997). However, partial melts of oceanic-crust lithologies (particularly pyroxene-rich rocks such as quartz and coesite eclogites that correspond to average oceanic crust) are silica saturated (Green et al., 1967), whereas many oceanic islands are characterized by low-silica, alkalic (i.e., ne-normative) lavas. This is particularly true of OIB localities with isotopic signatures most clearly associated with recycled crustal materials (i.e., those with enriched mantle “EM1, EM2” and “HIMU” [high 238U/206Pb] signatures; e.g., Hofmann, 1997), which are typically composed of alkali basalts, basanites, and nephelinites (Fig. 1). The formation of these highly undersaturated magmas thus presents a challenge for models that require recycled, pyroxene-rich oceanic crust to constitute a major component of the source regions of OIBs.

Small-degree partial melts of peridotite at high pressure can be strongly alkalic (Takahashi and Kushiroy, 1983), particularly when generated in the presence of carbonate (Hirose, 1997). Peridotites are thus potential sources for some alkali OIB magmas, but experimentally produced partial melts of peridotite are generally too aluminoous at a given MgO concentration to be parental to typical OIB suites (Fig. 1), and geochemical evidence favors production of some OIB magmas partly from partial fusion of pyroxene-rich lithologies (Hauri, 2002). Alkalic glasses also result from partial melting of a mixture of subducted crust and peridotite at pressures of 2–3.5 GPa (Kogiso et al., 1998; Yaxley and Green, 1998), and thus melting of such mixtures might explain both the involvement of oceanic crust and the alkalic character of OIBs with crustal geochemical signatures. Such mixtures could be produced by mechanical disaggregation of subducted eclogite (Tabit et al., 1997) or by hybridization of peridotite by partial melts of eclogite (Yaxley and Green, 1998). However, partial melts of such hybridized peridotite have low CaO and high Al₂O₃ relative to probable OIB parental lavas (Fig. 1) (Kogiso et al., 1998). Also, linear mixing trends between incompatible (Pb, He, Sr) and compatible (Os) isotope ratios are difficult to reconcile with a source composed of peridotite with small proportions of admixed subducted crust (Hauri, 1997; Becker, 2000). It is therefore important to investigate experimentally whether pyroxenite (a term we use to encompass all pyroxene-dominated rocks, including garnet pyroxenite, websterite, eclogite, etc.) can produce highly undersaturated partial melts from which oceanic-island lavas might be plausibly derived.

Several lines of evidence suggest that partial melts of some pyroxenites can be silica undersaturated. Apparently endogenous ne-normative glass has been documented in pyroxenite xenoliths (Francis, 1991). Chemographic analysis of simple systems (O’Hara, 1968) and thermodynamic modeling in more complex systems (Hirschmann and Pertermann, 2000; Schiano et al., 2000) reveal that the aluminous pyroxene plane (e.g., the ternary CaSiO₃-MgSiO₃-Al₂O₃) is a thermal divide, so either silica-rich or silica-poor liquids can coexist with garnet and pyroxene. Finally, mildly alkalic liquids (>4 wt% normative ne) result from melting experiments on eclogite (Ito and Kennedy, 1974), clinopyroxenite, and olivine clinopyroxenite (Kogiso and Hirschmann, 2001). Yet, relatively little is known about formation of alkalic liquids by partial melting of pyroxenite, and to our knowledge, there have been no reports of experimentally produced partial melts of pyroxenite that are comparable to the low-silica (<45 wt%) lavas commonly erupted at oceanic islands. Here we report strongly ne-normative liquids produced by partial melting of a garnet pyroxenite at 2 and 2.5 GPa.

EXPERIMENTAL METHODS
The starting material for the experiments is a mixture of two natural pyroxenites from the Balmuccia massif (Shervais and Mukasa, 1991); it approximates a typical mantle pyroxenite composition based on a survey of worldwide occurrences (Fig. 2). Experiments with a preliminary mixture produced large (400 µm) porphyroblasts of garnet with many inhomogeneous inclusions of pyroxene, so 1 wt% finely powdered pyrope was added as crystal seeds. The final mixture, MIX1G, was dried at 1000 °C for 1.5 h in a CO₂-H₂ gas stream near the fayalite-magnetite-quartz buffer and then ground in agate until it passed through a 15 µm screen. The bulk composition was determined by microprobe analysis of a glass fused at 1500 °C and 1 GPa (Table 1). Experiments were conducted in a piston-cylinder apparatus using the methods of Baker and Stolper (1994). For experiments in which the expected degree of partial melting was small, the diamond aggre-
Figure 1. Compositions of mafic lavas from representative oceanic-island chains associated with strong signatures of recycling (small color symbols) compared to glasses from partial-melting experiments, including partial melts of MIX1G garnet pyroxenite (red and orange squares), anhydrous peridotite (2–5 GPa) (Hirose and Kushiro, 1993; Walter, 1998), pyroxenite + peridotite hybrid experiments (3–3.5 GPa) (Kogiso et al., 1998; Yaxley and Green, 1998), and carbonated peridotite (3 GPa) (Hirose, 1997). Carbonated peridotite partial melts are highly magnesian (23–24.9 wt% MgO) and have been projected down to 20 wt% MgO along an olivine fractionation trend by assuming that $K_{Fe-Mg}^\text{eq} = 0.35$. Oceanic-island basalt (OIB) data from Georoc database (http://georoc.mpch-mainz.gwdg.de/ [accessed August 2002]) from selected island chains with extreme isotopic signatures: EM1—Pitcairn; EM2—Samoa, Tristan da Cunha, Marquesas, Societies, Cook-Australis; HIMU—St. Helena, Canaries, Azores, Cook-Australis.

Figure 2. Comparison of MIX1G starting material to spectrum of mantle pyroxenite compositions from xenoliths and from orogenic massifs (Hirschmann and Stolper, 1996) and from mid-oceanic-ridge basalt (MORB) selected from Petdb database (http://petdb.ldeo.columbia.edu/petdb/ [accessed August 2002]).

Figure 3. Partial-melting behavior of garnet pyroxenites in pseudoternary system $\text{Mg}_2\text{SiO}_4$ (Fo)–$\text{CaAl}_2\text{Si}_2\text{O}_6$ (CaTs)–$\text{SiO}_2$ (Qz) projected from diopside [Di], using projection methods of O’Hara (1968). Ne- and hy-normative compositions are separated by join between Fo and anorthite (An), as indicated by dashed line. All stoichiometric garnet and pyroxene plot along thermal divide defined by En (enstatite)–CaTs. Silica-excess pyroxenites, such as those with composition of mid-oceanic-ridge basalt (MORB), plot to silica-rich side of this join and produce hy- or qz-normative partial melts, as illustrated by G2 partial-melting experiments of Pertermann and Hirschmann (2003). Silica-deficient pyroxenites, such as MIX1G, plot to silica-poor side of join and produce Si-poor ne- or hy-normative partial melts. Compositions of oceanic-island basalt (OIB) from Figure 1 are plotted for comparison (gray circles). Inset shows schematic partial-melting relationships for MIX1G. Mass balance requires that melt coexisting with garnet and pyroxene plot strongly to silica-deficient side of thermal divide. Note that many natural pyroxenites (from compilation of Hirschmann and Stolper, 1996) are also silica-deficient.

EXPERIMENTAL RESULTS

At 2.5 GPa between 1375 and 1500 °C, aluminous clinopyroxene (cpx) and garnet (gt) are stable phases in MIX1G pyroxenite (Table 1 and Table DR11). Olivine (ol) and spinel are present in runs quenched at 1375 and 1400 °C. Glass was observed at 1400 and 1500 °C. At 1375 °C, glass is not present in the main charge and material between diamond aggregate grains was lost during polishing, so we cannot be sure whether partial melting occurred. We assume that the MIX1G solidus is between 1375 and 1400 °C at 2.5 GPa. At 2 GPa, cpx, spinel, and glass are present between 1350 and 1400 °C; garnet is present at 1350 and 1375 °C. Thus, it appears that the solidus of MIX1G garnet pyroxenite, is available from Documents Secretary, GSA, P.O. Box 9140, Boulder, CO 80301-9140, editing@geosociety.org, or at www.geosociety.org/pubs/ft2003.htm.

$^1$GSA Data Repository item 2003072, Table DR1, mineral compositions and modes from experiments on MIX1G garnet pyroxenite, is available from Documents Secretary, GSA, P.O. Box 9140, Boulder, CO 80301-9140, editing@geosociety.org, or at www.geosociety.org/pubs/ft2003.htm.
MIX1G is just lower than that of fertile mantle peridotite, which is 1363 and 1418 °C ± 20 at 2 and 2.5 Gpa, respectively (Hirschmann, 2000). Glasses are low in SiO₂(42.7–45.2 wt%), and compositions range from mildly ne-normative (2%) alkali picritic at high temperature to strongly ne-normative (9–14%) basanitic (Table 1). All glasses are rich in MgO (10.6–15.0 wt%) and CaO (9.3–11.2 wt%) (Fig. 1).

**DISCUSSION**

**Comparison to Lavas from Oceanic Islands**

The characteristics of source regions of oceanic islands have received relatively little attention from experimental petrologists. The exceptions are studies pertaining to Hawaii (e.g., Eggins, 1992; Wagner and Grove, 1998, and citations therein), but most Hawaiian lavas are tholeitic, so such work is not directly applicable to the origins of silica-deficient compositions. While the MIX1G glasses are not ideal matches to likely parental rocks, many natural pyroxenites from xenolith and peridotite massifs are lower oceanic crust or from fragments of delaminated lower continental crust (Barth et al., 2002).

**Producing Alkaline Liquids from Pyroxenites**

Production of alkaline liquids by partial melting of garnet pyroxenite can be understood by considering the pseudoternary system forsterite (Fo, Mg₂SiO₄)–Ca-Tschermak pyroxene (CaTs, CaAl₂Si₂O₆)–quartz (Qz, SiO₂) projected from diopside [Di, CaMgSi₂O₆] (Fig. 3), using the projection scheme of O’Hara (1968). In this projection, all stoichiometric garnet and pyroxene plot along the join between enstatite (En) and CaTs, so this join is a thermal divide when cpx and garnet are the sole minerals in the residue (O’Hara, 1968). Thus, silica-excess garnet pyroxenites have bulk compositions on the Si-rich side of the divide and generate silicic partial melts (Fig. 3), and silica-deficient garnet pyroxenites, as the one studied here, plot on the Si-poor side of the divide and generate low-silica partial melts. Accessory minerals characteristic of silica-excess garnet pyroxenites are quartz, coesite, feldspar, and/or kyanite, whereas silica-deficient compositions have small amounts of olivine, spinel, and/or Fe-Ti oxide. Mid-oceanic-ridge basalt (MORB) compositions form silica-excess garnet pyroxenite at high pressure, and partially melt to form hy- or qz-normative liquids. In contrast, MIX1G has accessory olivine and spinel under nearly-solidus conditions, and therefore can generate strongly ne-normative liquids (Fig. 2).

If typical oceanic basalt is not silica-deficient, are there plausible processes that might convert MORB protoliths to silica-deficient pyroxenite prior to delivery to OIB source regions? Extraction of partial melt or fluid from eclogite in subduction zones cannot generate silica-deficient residues, though it can generate bimineralic compositions, i.e., those consisting solely of garnet and cpx and falling on the thermal divide. Partial melts of bimineralic garnet pyroxenite can be alkalic (Ito and Kennedy, 1974), and further investigation is required to determine if they can form compositions plausibly parental to OIB. Conversion of silica-excess or bimineralic pyroxenite to silica-deficient pyroxenite (as has been invoked by Lundstrom et al., 2000) requires either (1) hybridization with peridotite; (2) metasomatism by a silica-deficient fluid such as carbonatite; or (3) removal of low-pressure partial melts or fluids in the presence of olivine or spinel.

Many natural pyroxenites from xenolith and peridotite massifs are silica deficient (Fig. 3), and silica-deficient pyroxenites in OIB source regions may originate from protoliths other than MORB. Cumulate oceanic gabbros with more olivine than feldspar (on a molar basis) are silica deficient, and the same may be true for olivine-bearing cpx- or garnet-rich delaminated lower crust of continents or arcs (Jull and Klemmen, 2001) and for veins formed in the oceanic lithosphere (Halliday et al., 1995). For example, the silica-deficient ilmenite eclogites from Koidu, Sierra Leone, are thought to originate either from subducted lower oceanic crust or from fragments of delaminated lower continental crust (Barth et al., 2002).

**Fate of Low-Silica Partial Melts of Pyroxenite**

An important question is whether alkalic partial melts of pyroxenite can maintain their petrologic character after they segregate from...
their sources. Strongly undersaturated liquids might react incongruently with orthopyroxene (opx) in peridotite, precipitate olivine, and thereby become similar in composition to partial melts of peridotite or hybridized peridotite. Lundstrom et al. (2000) argued that such reactions promote formation of dunite channels. If pyroxenite bodies have relatively large spatial dimensions, their partial melts could segregate into conduits that allow transport without significant interaction with peridotite (Kogiso et al., 2000). Such conduits must exist in the shallow mantle—otherwise, highly undersaturated magmas could not traverse the lithosphere—but it is less clear whether they exist at greater depths. On the other hand, opx may be absent from near-solidus peridotite above 3.5 GPa (Walter, 1998), so partial melts of garnet pyroxenite formed at great depths may not be much-affected by melt-rock reactions at high pressure.

CONCLUSIONS

Oceanic-island basalts with strong signatures of crustal recycling are silica-poor and unlike high-pressure partial melts of typical oceanic crust, which are silica-rich. But a wide class of mantle pyroxenites are silica-deficient, and experiments on a silica-deficient pyroxenite at 2–2.5 GPa show that partial melts are low in silica and have similarities to alkaline OIB with strong recycling signatures. Partial melt compositions are more aluminous than such OIB, but this difference may diminish at higher pressure.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank John Shervais for samples of Balmuccia pyroxenite and Laura Wasylenki for assistance with the experiments. This work was supported by National Science Foundation grants EAR-9219899 and OCE-9314505 (to Stolper) and OCE-9706526 and OCE-9876255 (to Hirschmann).

REFERENCES CITED


Kogiso, T., Hirschmann, M.M., and Reiners, P.W., 2000, Constraints from isotopic variations on the physical dimensions of chemical heterogeneities in oceanic basalt source regions: Eos (Transactions, American Geophysical Union), v. 81, p. F1280.


Procedure received 17 October 2002

Manuscript received 5 March 2003

Manuscript accepted 7 March 2003

Printed in USA

484 GEOLOGY, June 2003